

Nota Bene

As individual contributor to the volume *Toward a Historical Sociolinguistic Poetics of Medieval Greek*, (eds.) Andrea M. Cuomo and Erich Trapp, Turnhout, Brepols, 2017 (Studies in Byzantine History and Civilization, 12), I would like to inform the reader of my article “Τεχνικὸς διδάσκαλος: Georgios Pachymeres as Paraphrast of Aristotelian Meteorology” (pp. 119–142), that errors occurred during the typesetting process, which cause difficulties in understanding some aspects of my argumentation, and I had not been given the chance to review and correct before publication.

The reader is kindly requested to take into consideration the pages of the present document and replace pp. 119, 127, 129, and p. 131 of the printed and/or electronic version of the article.

With apologies for the inconvenience,

The contributor

Ioannis Telelis

March 2018

Τεχνικός διδάσκαλος: Georgios Pachymeres as Paraphrast of Aristotelian Meteorology

1. Introduction¹

In an extensive epigram dedicated to the memory of his teacher Georgios Pachymeres, Manuel Philes² – the prominent Byzantine court poet of the early fourteenth century – praises the art in philosophical writing and the teaching skills of the Byzantine polymath with the following verses:

Νῦν καὶ σὺ νῦν τέθνηκας, ὦ γέρων Πλάτων·
 Οὐ γὰρ μετεμψύχωσις, οὐδὲ Σωκράτης, (30)
 Γλώττης δὲ ταυτότης σε καὶ τέχνης κράτος
 Ἐμπνουν καθαρώς ὠργάνουν τῷ κειμένῳ.
 Ἀριστότελες, ἄρα κομπάζεις ἔτι;
 Καὶ μὴν κρυβῆναι δεῖ σε καὶ σιγὴν ἄγειν,
 Κλείσαντα σουτοῦ δυστυχῶς τὰ βιβλία. (35)
 Ὅ γὰρ κατὰ σέ τεχνικός διδάσκαλος
 Ἄριστον ἐκτήσατο καὶ φίλον τέλος...³

The whole poem is an epitaph.⁴ The poet follows standard poetic formulas in order to build the praise of Georgios Pachymeres' life and deeds.⁵ The above-mentioned section of the funerary poem offers a reaf-

¹ I would like to thank Ruth Macrides, Andrea Cuomo, and the anonymous reviewers for revising the final version of this article and making valuable suggestions and remarks.

² On Manuel Philes' biography, see recently: Rhoby (2016).

³ Philes, *Carm.* 39, 29–37 (ed. Miller, v. 2, p. 402); cf. TLG Canon: 2718.001, DBBE: <http://www.dbbe.ugent.be/occ/8936>. Proposed translation: *But now, even you have died, oh old-man Plato; / for it was neither metempsychosis nor Socrates, / but the sameness of the discourse and the majesty of the art, / which clearly delineated your animate form in the text. / Do you still boast, oh Aristotle? / Alas! You should close your own books and hide in silence, / because the skilful teacher of your doctrines / had an excellent and amiable end...*

⁴ On Manuel Philes' epitaphs, cf. Papadogiannakis 1984.

⁵ For a general presentation of Georgios Pachymeres' life and work, see Talbot 1991, and Zografidis 2011.

ties. This aim was served by several explanatory comments. Furthermore, Pachymeres interpolated various examples and used his own words and phrases that – in all possibility – would sound familiar to his Byzantine target audience. Instances:

3.1.1. Discussion of the Meteors Pertaining to the Middle Celestial Band³⁶

<i>Arist. Mete. I (341b.24–35)</i>	<i>Pachym. In Mete. I.1.2 (p. 5,8–22)</i>
<p>Διαφέρει δ' ἤδη κατὰ τὴν τοῦ ὑπεκκαύματος θέσιν ἢ τὸ πλῆθος.</p> <p>ἂν μὲν γὰρ πλάτος ἔχη καὶ μῆκος τὸ ὑπέκκαυμα, πολλάκις ὄραται καιομένη φλόξ ὥσπερ ἐν ἀρούρα καιομένης καλάμης,</p> <p>ἐὰν δὲ κατὰ μῆκος μόνον, οἱ καλούμενοι δαλοὶ καὶ αἶγες καὶ ἀστέρες.</p> <p>ἐὰν μὲν πλεόν τὸ ὑπέκκαυμα ἢ κατὰ τὸ μῆκος ἢ τὸ πλάτος, ὅταν μὲν οἶον ἀποσπινθηρίζῃ ἅμα καιόμενον (τοῦτο δὲ γίνεται διὰ τὸ παρεκπυροῦσθαι, κατὰ μικρὰ μὲν, ἐπ' ἀρχὴν δέ), αἶξ καλεῖται,</p> <p>ὅταν δ' ἄνευ τούτου τοῦ πάθους, δαλός.</p> <p>ἐὰν δὲ τὰ μῆκη τῆς ἀναθυμιάσεως κατὰ μικρὰ τε καὶ πολλαχῇ διεσπαρμένα ἢ καὶ ὁμοίως κατὰ πλάτος καὶ βάθος, οἱ δοκούντες ἀστέρες διάττειν γίνονται.</p>	<p>Διαφέρει δὲ κατὰ τὴν τοῦ ὑπεκκαύματος θέσιν ἢ τὸ πλῆθος, ὥστε <u>ἄλλως καὶ ἄλλως</u> γίνεσθαι τὸ φαινόμενον καὶ διαφόρους φέρειν ὀνομασίας.</p> <p>ἂν μὲν γὰρ πλάτος ἔχη καὶ μῆκος τὸ ὑπέκκαυμα, πολλάκις ὄραται καιομένη φλόξ ἐν τῷ οὐρανῷ, ὥσπερ ἐν ἀρούρα καιομένης καλάμης. καὶ λέγεται τότε φλόξ ὅτι καὶ μῆκος καὶ πλάτος ἐπέλαβε τὸ ὑπέκκαυμα.</p> <p>ἐὰν δὲ κατὰ μῆκος μόνον, οἱ καλούμενοι δαλοὶ φαίνονται καὶ αἶγες καὶ ἀστέρες.</p> <p>ἐὰν δὲ πλεῖον τὸ ὑπέκκαυμα ἢ κατὰ τε μῆκος καὶ πλάτος, ὅταν μὲν οἶον ἀποσπινθηρακίῃ (τοῦτο δὲ γίνεται διὰ τὸ παρεκπυροῦσθαι τὰ μόρια τοῦ ὑπεκκαύματος, κατὰ μικρὰ μὲν, ἐπ' ἀρχὴν δὲ μίαν), αἶξ καλεῖται ἀπὸ τῶν τῆς αἶγος τριγῶν ἀραιῶν φρισσοῦσῶν τὴν ὀνομασίαν σχοῦσα. ὅταν δ' ἄνευ τούτου τοῦ πάθους, δαλός.</p> <p>ἐὰν δὲ τὰ μῆκη τῆς ἀναθυμιάσεως κατὰ μικρὰ τε καὶ πολλαχῇ διεσπαρμένα ἢ καὶ ὁμοίως κατὰ πλάτος καὶ βάθος, οἱ ἀστέρες οἱ διάττειν δοκούντες γίνονται, οὗς καὶ <u>διάττοντας</u> λέγομεν.</p>

A comparison between Aristotle's text and Pachymeres' paraphrase shows interesting points of deviation from the Aristotelian source-text. While expounding on the differences of the meteors that pertain the middle celestial band and occur as consequence from differences in the orientation and quantity of the existing inflammable material, Pachymeres interpolates that different phenomena have different names:

³⁶ Pachymeres' original text is printed in italics. Text that reflects influence from late antique commentators or other sources is printed in underlined italic type.

in the use of first-person plural verb while mentioning the name of the shooting stars: *οὕς και διὰττοντας λέγομεν*. This last phrase may be interpreted as sign of oral speech in Pachymeres' text.

3.1.2. Discussion of Exhalation's Ignition in the Lower Celestial Band

<i>Arist. Mete. 341b.35–342a.3</i>	<i>Pachym. In Mete. 1.1.3 (p. 6,1–22)</i>
<p>ὄτε μὲν οὖν ὑπὸ τῆς κινήσεως ἢ ἀναθυμιάσις ἐκκαιομένη γεννᾷ αὐτά·</p> <p>ὄτε δὲ ὑπὸ τοῦ διὰ τὴν ψύξιν συνισταμένου ἀέρος ἐκθλίβεται καὶ ἐκκρίνεται τὸ θερμόν, διὸ καὶ ἔοικεν ἢ φορὰ ῥίψει μᾶλλον αὐτῶν,</p> <p>ἀλλ' οὐκ ἐκκαύσει.</p>	<p>Ὅτε μὲν οὖν ὑπὸ τῆς κινήσεως ἢ ἀναθυμιάσις ἐκκαιομένη γεννᾷ ταῦτα <u>καὶ ἔστιν αὕτη ποιητικὴ αἰτία τῶν τοιούτων</u>, ὄτε δὲ ὑπὸ τοῦ διὰ τὴν ψύξιν συνισταμένου ἀέρος ἐκθλίβεται καὶ ἐκκρίνεται τὸ θερμόν· διὸ <u>καὶ ἡ φορὰ τῶν τοιούτων ἀπάντων ἔοικε ῥίψει</u>. ἢ γὰρ ἄνω κινήσις ἐκκαίει τὸ ὑπέκκαυμα· καὶ ἔδει μὲν ἀναχθῆναι, ἀλλὰ διὰ τὴν ἐκείσε τοῦ ἀέρος πύκνωσιν, μὴ δυνάμενον ἀνάγεσθαι, ἐκθλίβεται κάτω· <u>καὶ ἔοικεν ἡ φορὰ ῥίψει</u>.</p> <p>οὐ δεῖ δὲ ἀπορεῖν πῶς ἄνω τούτου πεπυκνωμένος ἀήρ εὐρίσκεται, ὁ μὴ εἰς αὐτὸ ἄνω φέρεσθαι· πῶς δὲ καὶ αὐτὸ ἐξεκαύθη, εἴπερ ἀήρ ψυχρὸς ἦν αὐτῷ ἐπικείμενος; οὐδὲ γὰρ ἅμα ἐν ἐνὶ τόπῳ ἅπαν τοῦτο γίνεται· ἀλλὰ τὸ ὑπέκκαυμα ἴσως ὥδε τυχὸν θερμότητος ἐκ τῆς κινήσεως τῆς ἄνω, οὐκ ἐμποδιζόντος ἐκείσε τοῦ ἀέρος διὰ τὸ εὐκρατον εἶναι τότε ὅτε ἐξήπτετο τὸ ὑπέκκαυμα, ἦν πρὸς τῷ φέρεσθαι ἄνω· μήπω δὲ τελειωθέντος ἢ καὶ ἐμποδισθέντος ἀπὸ τινος αἰτίας, ἐν τοσοῦτῳ εὐαλλοιωτος ὢν ἀήρ, ἅμα ἀλλοιοῦται ἐν ἄλλῳ τόπῳ ἐκ τινος συμπεσοῦσης αἰτίας καὶ ἐναπολαμβάνει φερόμενον· καὶ οὕτως ἐκεῖνο περικλεισθέν, μὴ ἔχον ἄνω ἐκθλιβῆναι διὰ τὴν πύκνωσιν τὴν ἐκεῖ τοῦ ἀέρος, κάτω ἐκθλίβεται· <u>καὶ οὕτως ἡ φορὰ ἐκείνη ἔοικε ῥίψει</u>, ἀλλ' οὐκ ἐκκαύσει.</p> <p>πολλάκις γὰρ καὶ τοῦτο γίνεται· καὶ οὐ γεγονός θερμόν πρότερον, εἴτα ἐκθλίβεται διὰ τὰς ῥηθείσας αἰτίας.</p>

3.1.3. Discussion of Meteors' Apparent Motion

<i>Arist. Mete. 342a.3–33 (passim)</i>	<i>Pachym. In Mete. 1.1.3 (p. 7,1–21)</i>
<p>... ὥσπερ ἡ ὑπὸ τοὺς λύχνους τιθεμένη ἀναθυμίασις ἀπὸ τῆς ἄνωθεν φλογὸς ἀπτεῖ τὸν κάτωθεν λύχρον...</p> <p>τὰ πλεῖστα δ' εἰς τὸ πλάγιον διὰ τὸ δύο φέρεσθαι φοράς, βία μὲν κάτω, φύσει δ' ἄνω...</p> <p>ὥσπερ οἱ ἐκ τῶν δακτύλων πυρῆνες, ὥστε καὶ εἰς τὴν γῆν καὶ εἰς τὴν θάλατταν φαίνεσθαι πίπτοντα.</p>	<p>γίνεται δὲ ἡ ἔκκαυσις ὡς ἐπὶ τῶν λύχνων· ὥσπερ γὰρ ἡ ὑπὸ τοὺς λύχνους τιθεμένη ἀναθυμίασις ἀπὸ τῆς ἄνωθεν φλογὸς ἀπτεῖ τὸν κάτω λύχρον διὰ τὸ εὐφρῆς τῆς ἀναθυμιάσεως πρὸς τὴν ἀναψιν, τὸν αὐτὸν τρόπον καὶ ἐν τοῖς τοιοῦτοις γίνεται. κεῖται γὰρ ἡ καπνώδης ἐκείνη ἀναθυμίασις κατὰ μῆκος τοῦ ἀέρος ἄνωθεν κάτω καὶ τῆς ἀρχῆς ἐκπυρωθείσης ἐπιλαμβάνεται ἡ φλόξ ἐκείνη τοῦ σύνεγγυς διὰ τὴν εὐφρῆαν πρὸς ἀναψιν τοῦ ὑπεκκαύματος τοῦ κατὰ μῆκος κειμένου· καὶ οὕτως ἡ ἔκκαυσις διερχομένη, καὶ συνεχῶς τὸ μὲν πρότερον ἀπολείπουσα τοῦ δ' ἐγγύς λαμβανομένη, δόκησιν παρέχει κινήσεως συνεχοῦς, ἡ δὲ κατὰ ῥίψιν μᾶλλον, πλειστάκις εἰς τὰ πλάγια φέρεται διὰ τὸ δύο φέρεσθαι φοράς· βία μὲν κάτω, φύσει δὲ ἄνω. καὶ τὴν μὲν φύσει, μὴ δύνασθαι φέρεσθαι διὰ τὴν πυκνότητα τοῦ ἄνω ἀέρος· τὴν δὲ, μὴ βούλεσθαι κινεῖσθαι διὰ τὸ παρά φύσιν εἶναι. καὶ διαταῦτα ἐμποδιζόμενον μὲν τὴν ἐπὶ τὸ ἄνω μὴ πεφυκὸς δὲ τὴν ἐπὶ τὸ κάτω φοράν, φερόμενον κάτω, οὐδὲ τὴν φυσικὴν ἀπολείπει κινήσιν· κἀντεῦθεν προσοχθίζον τῇ κάτω τὴν δ' ἄνω ζητοῦν, ἀναγκαίως μέσον δυοῖν τούτων φέρεται. καὶ ἔστι τοῦτο τὸ πλάγιον. κινουῦνται δὲ τῇ ἐκθλίψει καὶ εἰς γῆν καὶ εἰς θάλασσαν, ὥσπερ οἱ ἐκ τῶν δακτύλων πυρῆνες (δηλονότι τὰ ἐλαιόκοκκα).</p>

Another interesting passage in the first section of *Philosophia* book 5, which includes Pachymeres' own comments, is the discussion of how the burning light of a meteor can appear as moving in a slanted direction in spite of its natural motion upwards. At this point Aristotle's source-text offers a concise analysis and presents two empirical examples (the extinguished lamps [λύχνους], and the kernels [πυρῆνες]) in order to illustrate the cause of the meteors' apparent motion. In Pachymeres' paraphrase, the Aristotelian analysis is supplemented by further arguments provided